Modelling West Antarctic ice sheet growth and collapse through the past five million years

David Pollard1 & Robert M. DeConto2

The West Antarctic ice sheet (WAIS), with ice volume equivalent to ~5 m of sea level1, has long been considered capable of past and future catastrophic collapse2-4. Today, the ice sheet is fringed by vulnerable floating ice shelves that buttress the fast flow of inland ice streams. Grounding lines are several hundred metres below sea level and the bed deepens upstream, raising the prospect of runaway retreat5-8. Projections of future WAIS behaviour have been hampered by limited understanding of past variations and their underlying forcing mechanisms9-11. Its variation since the Last Glacial Maximum is best known, with grounding lines advancing to the continental-shelf edges around 15 ky ago before retreating to near-modern locations by ~3 ky ago. Prior collapses during the warmth of the early Pliocene epoch9 and some Pleistocene interglacials have been suggested indirectly from records of sea level and deep-sea-core isotopes, and by the discovery of open-ocean diatoms in subglacial sediments10. Until now11, however, little direct evidence of such behaviour has been available. Here we use a combined ice sheet/ice shelf model12 capable of high-resolution nesting with a new treatment of grounding-line dynamics and ice-shelf buttressing13 to simulate Antarctic ice sheet variations over the past five million years. Modelled WAIS variations range from full glacial extents with grounding lines near the continental shelf break, intermediate states similar to modern, and brief but dramatic retreats, leaving only small, isolated ice caps on West Antarctic islands. Transitions between glacial, intermediate and collapsed states are relatively rapid, taking one to several thousand years. Our simulation is in good agreement with a new sediment record (ANDRILL AND-1B) recovered from the western Ross Sea14, indicating a long-term trend from more frequently collapsed to more glaciated states, dominant 40-kyr cyclicity in the Pliocene, and major retreats at marine isotope stage 31 (~1.07 Myr ago) and other super-interglacials.

Large-scale modelling of the WAIS requires an ice-sheet model that combines the flow regimes of grounded and floating ice efficiently enough to allow simulations of ~10^7 yr or more. This is challenging, because the scaled equations for the two regimes are very different, and near the grounding line they interact in a boundary-layer zone that affects the large-scale dynamics5. More rigorous higher-order flow models without separate scalings are currently too computationally expensive for long-term continental applications.13. Our approach simply combines the scaled sheet and shelf equations13, while capturing grounding-line effects by imposing a new mass-flux condition5. Other standard model components predict variations in ice thickness, ice temperatures, and bedrock elevation below the ice (see Methods).

The multi-million-year timescales considered here are beyond the capability of most climate models to provide the necessary time-continuous forcings required by the ice sheet model. Instead we use techniques similar to those used in previous studies14-16 and drive the model with simple parameterizations of surface mass balance, air temperature and specified sea level. A new parameterization of sub-ice-shelf ocean melt based on modern observations14-16 accounts for changes in the shape of coastlines and distance from the ice edge to open ocean (see Methods).

Before considering long-term simulations, it is helpful to examine the link between equilibrated ice-sheet states and the strength of various forcing mechanisms (Fig. 1) representative of extreme interglacial (left of graphs), modern interglacial (middle) and full glacial (right) conditions. In between the values shown, each forcing is linearly interpolated along the x axis. This closely approximates how they co-vary in long-term simulations, but not exactly due to independent influences of δ18O and austral insolation (see below). The envelopes of ocean-melt values are chosen so that complete WAIS collapse and full glacial expansion are just attained.

Figure 1a indicates a smoothly varying response from intermediate to large WAIS sizes, with sharper transitions into and out of extreme interglacials (collapses), and also back from full glacial to intermediate states. This behaviour is seen in long-term simulations and animations (Supplementary Videos 1, 2), with rapid transitions taking from one to several thousand years. The whole range of Antarctic states in the model is more or less one-dimensional, that is, the Ross, Weddell and Amundsen Sea sectors of the WAIS usually retreat and expand in unison, resulting in just one type of configuration for a given total ice volume. This suggests that the broad-scale Plio-Pleistocene history of the WAIS is represented at the ANDRILL AND-1B drill site11, and persistent absence of a Ross ice shelf is indeed indicative of major WAIS retreat.

The relative importance of individual forcing mechanisms is shown in Fig. 1b. For modern to extreme interglacial conditions, changes in surface climate and sea level are relatively small, while changes in ocean melt are dominant via their effect on ice-shelf buttressing. For modern to glacial conditions, a combination of ocean-melt and sea-level changes is needed to produce realistic WAIS expansion. Changes in precipitation and surface temperature have significant, but largely cancelling, effects: without reduced precipitation in cooler climates, glacial volumes are too large (‘no ΔP’, Fig. 1b); without the effects of cooler surface temperatures on internal ice temperatures, viscosities and basal sliding, glacial ice flows too easily and volumes are too small (‘no ΔT’, Fig. 1b).

A five-million-year simulation (Fig. 2) is performed from the early Pliocene to present, with the long-term variation of each forcing mechanism parameterized largely as a function of deep-sea-core δ18O (ref. 16). Sea level over most of this interval is dominated by Northern Hemispheric ice volume, and can be readily prescribed in proportion to δ18O. The responses of Antarctic surface temperature and precipitation to Pleistocene glacial cycles are also reasonably constrained by climate studies and observations, and we adapt established

1Earth and Environmental Systems Institute, Pennsylvania State University, University Park, Pennsylvania 16802, USA. 2Department of Geosciences, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, Massachusetts 01003, USA.
parameters using $\delta^{18}O$ and austral insolation as inputs (equations (1) and (2) in Methods).

Factors controlling past variations of oceanic sub-ice melt on $\sim 10^7$ yr timescales are less certain. Sub-ice oceanic melting is affected in part by circum-Antarctic deep-water (CDW) warmth and its incursions onto continental shelves\(^3\). We argue that CDW and sub-ice melt have been mainly controlled by far-field climatic influences that vary in step with Northern Hemispheric glacial–interglacial cycles (see Methods). Without identifying the explicit link (which may involve atmospheric CO$_2$, meridional overturning circulation, sea level, or other global-scale teleconnections), we hypothesize that temporal variations of Antarctic sub-ice ocean melt rates are represented by records that correlate with Northern Hemispheric glacial variations, that is, deep-sea-core $\delta^{18}O$ (equations (6)–(8) in Methods). A minor additional influence on sub-ice melt from austral summer orbital insolation anomalies\(^2\) is also needed to produce precessional cyclicity that is observed during marine isotope stage 31 (MIS 31) around 1 Myr ago\(^11,21\). Our forcing is warmest during the early Pliocene warm period ($\sim 5$ to $\sim 3$ Myr ago) due to light $\delta^{18}O$ values at that time; however, the parameterizations are based more on Pleistocene variations, and may not fully represent the warm Pliocene if unique processes (for example, persistent El Niño)\(^9\) were involved.

With long-term forcing variations mainly following deep-sea-core $\delta^{18}O$ (ref. 18), the ice-sheet model is continuously integrated over the past 5 Myr (Fig. 2). Except for small variations along the Wilkes margin\(^2\) and in inlets such as Prydz bay\(^2\), East Antarctica is stable throughout the simulation and nearly all of the ice-volume variability is due to West Antarctica. Several key aspects of the model time series agree with the AND-1B core\(^11\). There is an overall progression from predominantly smaller WAIS sizes to larger. Furthermore, intervals of WAIS collapse with little or no marine ice are much more common from $\sim 5$ to $3$ Myr ago, which is consistent with intervals in the drillcore dominated by diatomaceous sediments indicating warmer sea surface temperatures, little or no summer sea ice, and an open marine Ross embayment\(^11\). In fact, the two thickest diatomaceous intervals in the core, between $\sim 4.3$ and $3.4$ Myr ago, correspond to the period with the most frequent and prolonged WAIS collapses simulated by the model. These collapses could well be continuous if additional Pliocene warm-period forcing was added\(^8\). After 3 Myr ago, there are longer intervals with modern-to-glacial ice volumes, that is, with ice-shelf or grounded-ice cover at or near the AND-1B site (Fig. 2), again in rough agreement with the increasing predominance of diamictite after 3 Myr ago indicating overriding ice or a proximal grounding zone\(^11\).

Brief WAIS super-interglacial collapses occur after 3 Myr ago but with decreased frequency. In some cases, these precisely match the thinner diatomaceous intervals in the AND-1B core, including the well-dated MIS 31 event at 1.07 Myr ago\(^11,21\). The large 100-kyr fluctuations of the past million years are similar to those modelled in earlier studies\(^6,7,27\). The last retreat of WAIS from ~1.5 Myr ago to the present roughly matches the observed retreat of Ross Sea grounding lines\(^24,25\), and is particularly realistic with modifications described in Supplementary Information section 6.

The model predicts several major WAIS collapses during Pleistocene interglacials (Fig. 2c), at times when $\delta^{18}O$ minima coincide with strong
austral summer insolation anomalies. The simulated collapse at MIS 31 corresponds well with core evidence\textsuperscript{11,21}, both in terms of timing and magnitude, but more recent collapses (for example, ~200 kyr ago) do not always coincide with the late-Pleistocene interglacials (~125 kyr ago and ~400 kyr ago) usually suspected of harbouring such events\textsuperscript{10,26,27}. Thus, while the total number of collapses is reasonable, their sometimes imprecise timings may reflect the limitations of our simple forcing parameterizations, including uncertainties in the 40-kyr phase relationship of Antarctic sub-ice melt to deep-sea-core δ\textsuperscript{18}O records, and the influence of local orbital insolation forcing. Although the model clearly captures the overall ~40-kyr periodicity seen in the AND-1B record, the precise phasing between Antarctic ice sheet variations and Northern Hemispheric climate changes remains uncertain. In some instances, the timing of our simulated superinterglacials may be an artefact of the phasing between the imposed δ\textsuperscript{18}O and austral summer insolation forcings. Recent observational and modelling studies on the relative timing of Northern Hemisphere ice volume variations, ocean meridional overturning and orbital forcing\textsuperscript{28–30} are pertinent to this issue, but with no clear consensus to date. These relationships could also be explored in future work with global climate models in combination with regional circum-Antarctic and sub-ice-shelf ocean modelling\textsuperscript{4,19}, to better ascertain the effects of Northern Hemispheric glacial cycles, orbital forcing and greenhouse gas concentrations on regional Antarctic conditions.

To better focus on the Ross embayment and the AND-1B site\textsuperscript{11}, we ran higher-resolution (10 km) nested ice sheet-shelf simulations for particular times, with boundary conditions at the domain edges obtained from the long-term all-Antarctic simulation. Figure 3 illustrates a wide range of WAIS states, from weak glacial, full WAIS collapse, to modern conditions. The modern network and behaviour of Siple Coast ice streams and Transantarctic outlet glaciers is well resolved (Fig. 3i), with some ice streams stagnating and re-activating over the several thousand years of the nested run\textsuperscript{31} (Supplementary Videos 3 and 4). Ross ice shelf velocities are also similar to observations, as is the central streamline dividing Siple (West Antarctic) and Transantarctic (East Antarctic) ice\textsuperscript{11}. The finer ice grid resolves the general ice flow around Ross Island, although the details of flow are not fully resolved within the narrow confines of McMurdo Sound containing AND-1B and other drill sites\textsuperscript{11,21}. When shelf ice is present at AND-1B (Fig. 3i), offshore flow just to the east is always northward, with ice originating from major Transantarctic outlet glaciers to the south (Byrd, Skelton, Mulock). This offshore flow pattern and its Transantarctic provenance prevail whenever there is shelf ice around Ross Island.

The dominant regional control is the overall strength of sub-ice oceanic melting in the Ross embayment, which causes both Siple- and Transantarctic-sourced ice to recede or advance in concert over the eastern and western sides of the embayment, respectively. It is very rare for one type or the other to dominate. Thus, although the provenance of shelf ice around Ross Island may be insensitive to the overall WAIS state, the basic presence or absence of shelf ice at the AND-1B site\textsuperscript{11} is a good qualitative indicator of maxima and minima in WAIS ice volume (Fig. 2). Other sites not yet cored in the central Ross embayment may offer even better potential for uniquely identifying times of WAIS collapse (Supplementary Fig. 3). These simulations show how

**Figure 3 | Snapshots at particular times from the long-term simulation in Fig. 2.** Shown are 1.094 Myr ago, 1.079 Myr ago (MIS 31 retreat) and modern. a–e. Grounded ice elevations and floating ice thicknesses, shown respectively (in m) by upper and lower colour scale on right. d–f. Surface ice speeds (m yr\textsuperscript{−1}), from higher-resolution (10 km) nested runs over the Ross embayment for the same three times, showing the whole nested domain. g–i. Floating ice thicknesses (m) and velocity vectors from the nested simulations, enlarged over the western Ross embayment. Vectors are shown only every third grid point for clarity. The location of AND-1B is shown by the black dot.
local observables in the AND-1B and other cores relate to overall WAIS evolution. In particular, our results imply that the presence or absence of grounded or floating ice in the vicinity of McMurdo Sound is indeed linked to WAIS ice volume, and that open-water conditions in the Ross Sea are indicative of partial to complete collapse of the WAIS.

Some of our results are independent of the parameterized temporal variations in long-term forcing. For example, the estimated magnitudes of sub-ice oceanic melt rates needed to produce full WAIS amplitudes (Fig. 1 and Methods) form a point of reference for future modelling. Another independent result is the tendency for the WAIS to experience relatively rapid transitions within one to a few thousand years, as forcing is smoothly varied. This includes transitions into and out of collapsed states, and from full glacial to modern-like ice extents. A collapse from modern conditions occurs when sub-ice ocean melting increases from 0.1 to 2 m yr$^{-1}$ under shelf interiors, and from 5 to 10 m yr$^{-1}$ near exposed shelf edges ($M_h$ and $M_v$, respectively, in equations (3), (7) and (8) in Methods). Recent melt rates under small Antarctic ice shelves are inferred to be increasing dramatically15,16. The relationship between sub-ice melt rates and ocean temperatures is just beginning to be explored17, but those data18,19 and simplified modelling20 suggest relationships on the order of 10 m yr$^{-1}$–1°C$^{-1}$ for smaller shelves, and 0.4 m yr$^{-1}$–1°C$^{-1}$ for whole-shelf averages under the major Ross and Filchner-Ronne shelves. Dividing our interior melt ($M_i$) increase of 1.9 m yr$^{-1}$ by the latter sensitivity of 0.4 m yr$^{-1}$–1°C$^{-1}$ suggests that the WAIS will begin to collapse when nearby ocean temperatures warm by roughly 5°C. Global climate and regional ocean modelling is needed to predict when and if future ocean temperatures and melt rates under the major Antarctic ice shelves will increase by these amounts, and if so, for how long.

**METHODS SUMMARY**

The scaled dynamical equations for sheet flow (shallow ice approximation) and shelf flow can be combined heuristically20. However, for efficiency in these long-term simulations, they are applied separately depending on whether ice is grounded or floating. Despite this simplification and coarse grids, the effects of the grounding-line boundary layer are captured by imposing a mass-flux condition across the grounding line following ref. 5, which sets ice velocities there as a function of ice thickness. To include important effects of ice-shelf buttressing, the imposed grounding-line velocities are reduced depending on the ratio of longitudinal stress to its free-floating value20 (see Supplementary Information). The model also contains three other standard components: (1) an ice-mass advection equation predicting ice thickness and accounting for surface accumulation minus ablation and basal melt, (2) an ice temperature equation including horizontal advection, vertical diffusion and shear heating, and (3) a bedrock elevation equation with local relaxation towards isostatic equilibrium and elastic lithospheric flexure6,7. There is no explicit basal hydrodynamics.

An ice-mass advection equation with local relaxation towards isostatic equilibrium and elastic lithospheric flexure is included in the model. The model also contains three other standard components: (1) an ice-mass advection equation predicting ice thickness and accounting for surface accumulation minus ablation and basal melt, (2) an ice temperature equation including horizontal advection, vertical diffusion and shear heating, and (3) a bedrock elevation equation with local relaxation towards isostatic equilibrium and elastic lithospheric flexure. There is no explicit basal hydrodynamics.

**Supplementary Information**

is linked to the online version of the paper at www.nature.com/nature.

Acknowledgements We thank T. Naish and R. Powell for discussions on this work, and P. Barrett for comments on the manuscript. This work was funded by the US National Science Foundation under awards ATM-0513420/0513421, ANT-034248 and ANT-0424589.

Author Information Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to D.P. (pollard@essc.psu.edu).
METHODS

Modern climatic forcing: temperature and precipitation. Modern forcing fields of annual surface mass-balance and temperature are specified using simple empirical parameterizations, and then varied in the past depending on ice-core or deep-sea-core time series, similarly to previous studies. Annual surface temperatures (°C) are

\[
T = T_m + 34.46 - 0.00914 h - 0.68775 |\phi| + 0.1 \Delta q + 10\Delta s/125
\]

(1)

where \(T_m = 0°\text{C}\), \(h\) is elevation (m), |\(\phi|\) is latitude (°S), \(\Delta q\) is annual orbital insolation anomaly from present at 80° S (W m⁻²), and \(\Delta s\) is sea-level departure from present (m) representing atmospheric CO₂ (see equation (6) below). Annual precipitation \(P\) (m yr⁻¹) is parameterized via temperature:

\[
P = 1.5 \times 2^{(T - T_m)/10}
\]

(2)

The fraction of precipitation falling as snow, and annual surface melt if any, are computed from \(T\) using a positive-degree-day (PDD) method with coefficient 0.005 m per degree-day. A sinuoidal seasonal temperature cycle of amplitude 0.1\(\Delta q\) (°C) is assumed, where \(\Delta q\) is January-minus-July 80° S insolation (W m⁻²). (Very little surface-melt occurs in our simulations, because summer air temperatures remain below freezing everywhere.)

Modern climatic forcing: sub-ice-shelf oceanic melt. A new parameterization of oceanic melt rates is used, based on the degree of protection by islands and bays, and distance to ice-shelf edge. Although simple, it captures basic features of other studies, such as rapid melting near edges, and yields reasonable modern shelf distributions. Modern sub-ice melt \(M\) (m yr⁻¹) is

\[
M = (1 - z_u) \left[ (1 - z_d) M_p + z_e M_e \right] + z_d M_d
\]

(3)

where the ‘deep-ocean’ weighting is

\[
z_u = \max(0, \min(1, (h_h - 1400)/200)]
\]

(4)

and the ‘exposed-shelf’ weighting is

\[
z_d = \max(0, \min(1, (A - 80)/30)] \cdot e^{-D/100}
\]

(5)

Here \(\max(x, y)\) indicates the greater of \(x\) and \(y\), and \(\min(x, y)\) indicates the lesser. The 3 modern oceanic melt rates \(M_p, M_d, and M_e\) in equations (3) are for protected, exposed-shelf and deep-ocean areas, respectively, given by \(M_p = 0.1\text{ m yr}^{-1}\), \(M_d = 5\text{ m yr}^{-1}\), and \(M_e = 5\text{ m yr}^{-1}\). In equations (4) and (5), \(h_h\) is bathymetry (m), \(A\) is the angle (degrees) subtended by the set of all straight lines from the point in question that reach open ocean without encountering land or grounded ice, and \(D\) (km) is the sub-ice distance to the closest open-ocean point. The angle \(A\) is the main way we achieve realistic modern ice-shelf edges. Around most of the Antarctic shelf edges today, \(A\) is ~90° to 100°; whether this coincidence has a physical basis requires exploration with regional ocean models.

Past climatic forcing: sea level, temperature and precipitation. We need to prescribe long-term variations of sub-ice oceanic melt rates, sea level, air temperature and precipitation over the past 5 Myr. On longer timescales, atmospheric CO₂ levels outside the Plio-Pleistocene range (~180–380 p.p.m.v.), basal sediment changes, and tectonic uplift or subsidence are probably important, but were probably minor through the Plio-Pleistocene. As mentioned above, our Pleistocene-centric parameterizations may underestimate warmth during the early Pliocene ~5–3 Myr ago when CO₂ levels rose to ~380 p.p.m.v. (ref. 9). Sea-level variations have been dominated by Northern Hemispheric ice volume, and are assumed proportional to deep-sea core δ¹⁸O and calibrated as in equation (6). Past variations of Antarctic annual surface temperatures are included in equation (1), proportional to a combination of atmospheric CO₂ (which is represented by δ¹⁸O via sea level in equation (1), since all three are highly correlated in the Pleistocene at least) and the annual 80° S insolation anomaly. Past variations in precipitation depend on air temperature, just as for modern spatial variations (equation (2)).

Past climatic forcing: sub-ice-shelf oceanic melt. The long-term controls of sub-ice-shelf melting are just beginning to be explored. Here we propose a parameterization based on simple reasoning and sensitivity tests of WAIS retreat since 15 kyr ago. This last deglacial retreat is the only well-documented WAIS variation on 10⁴-year time scales. It cannot have been driven by surface mass balance, because Antarctic precipitation has increased, not decreased, and there has been negligible surface melt during this time. Model sensitivity tests show that sea-level rise alone, and/or the influence of warming temperatures on ice viscosity and basal sliding, account for only a small fraction of the observed retreat. Therefore, increases in sub-ice melting must have been key. They could reasonably have been driven either by regional Southern Hemispheric orbital insolation changes, or by global-scale far-field influences. Southern Hemispheric insolation is unlikely to have been the dominant driver, because (1) the summertime 80° S anomaly from present was small and negative between 15 and 2 kyr ago, and (2) the annual 80° S anomaly, with minimum at 28.7 kyr ago and maximum at 9.5 kyr ago (ref. 20), would have caused retreat to commence too early (before ~19 kyr ago) judging from Ross Sea grounding-line history (~10 kyr ago)²⁴.²⁵. This is borne out by sensitivity tests (Supplementary Fig. 5) in which astral insolation is used as the sole driver of sub-ice melt, and results over the past 15,000 years are unreasonable. Realistic retreat is obtained only if sub-ice melt varies in step with far-field forcing.

This suggests that sub-ice melt has been controlled not by local forcing or astral insolation, but by far-field climatic influences that vary in step with Northern Hemispheric glacial–interglacial cycles at least since ~2.5 Myr ago. The latter is represented here by a stacked deep-sea-core δ¹⁸O record spanning the past 5 Myr (ref. 18). A small influence of astral summer insolation is added to produce minor observed 20-kyr cyclicity during warm events such as MIS 31. First, a weighting index \(w_g\) is defined by

\[
w_g = \max(0, \min(2, 1 + 8\Delta q/85 + \max(0, \Delta q/40)])
\]

where δ¹⁸O is represented by \(A\), the sea-level departure from present (m, scaled to δ¹⁸O with last-glacial-maximum 125 m lower than present), and \(\Delta q\) is the January 80° S insolation anomaly from present (W m⁻²). Sub-ice-melt rates for protected, exposed-shelf and deep-sea areas ([\(M_p, M_d, M_e\)]) respectively, in m yr⁻¹) are specified as \(0.02\) for maximum-glacial conditions, \(0.1, 5, 5\) for modern, and \(2, 10, 10\) for extreme-interglacial conditions. Then the triplet used in equation (3) to determine \(M\) for any past time is

\[
\begin{align*}
M_p, M_d, M_e &= (1 - w_g) [0, 0, 2] + w_g [0.1, 5, 5] & \text{if } 0 \leq w_g < 1 \\
M_p, M_d, M_e &= 2 - w_g [0.1, 5, 5] + (w_g - 1) [2, 10, 10] & \text{if } 1 \leq w_g \leq 2
\end{align*}
\]

The modern triplet values are chosen to yield reasonable results for today’s Ross and Filchner-Ronne ice shelves. The glacial and warm triplets and the form of \(w_g\) in equation (6) are chosen so that the model just attains full-glacial WAIS extents and complete interglacial collapses in long-term simulations and in Fig. 1. These values cannot be changed by large amounts without substantial degradation of our results.